Aurora Teagarden (Candace Cameron Bure), her new beau Professor Nick Miller (Niall Matter) and her young cousin Phillip (Dylan Sloane) arrive for a Real Murders Club meeting, where it is discovered that someone has broken in and trashed the “Lipstick Killer” crime display/presentation Aurora had prepared, slashing pictures and leaving an eerie message/quote. Club members Terry Sternholz (Catherine Hough Haggquist) and Davis Mettle (Cole Vigue) are already trying to figure out what this means. Next, someone breaks into Aida’s office, steals her computer and smashes a photo of Aurora.

Obviously, someone is taunting Roe, but when she goes to the library and discovers that Lillian’s (Ellie Harvie) car has been vandalized and stolen, Aida’s laptop computer left amid the broken glass in the empty parking space along with another taunting note, it’s clear that the game is getting more dangerous. Anyone could be behind this game, starting with new club member Davis Mettle, or Edward Irons (Gerard Plunkett), who already holds a grudge against Aurora. Roe’s best friend Sally (Lexa Doig) is targeted, and when she is knocked unconscious in front of Aurora’s house in broad daylight, the game escalates even further, with attempted murder charges looming. The list of suspects expands to include Aurora’s cleaning lady Valerie (Juliana Wimbles) and Nick’s teaching assistant Dina (Nicole LaPlaca) when visiting Professor Bree Carson (Tammy Gillis) agrees to create a profile for the perpetrator that indicates someone could be jealous of Roe’s budding relationship with Nick.

As more and more people close to Aurora are targeted, it becomes clear that Aurora is in grave danger. As Bree points out, all the attacks and taunting notes are likely leading up to the murder of Aurora Teagarden. After Aurora notices a news story about a Tacoma killer who quoted romance novels in notes left with his/her victims, she soon finds herself confronted by the killer, who is intent on “eliminating the competition” – Aurora. What happens next brings the game of cat and mouse full circle.

With help too far away and the killer fully prepared to carry out their next murder, Aurora Teagarden will have to use her words, her wits and every ounce of courage she can muster to escape death.